OPERATIONAL AUDIT

OKLAHOMA AERONAUTICS COMMISSION CITY OF WEATHERFORD PROJECT NUMBER OJA-11-F LENGTHENING OF EXISTING RUNWAY

For the period November 10, 2010 through December 2, 2013





Oklahoma State Auditor & Inspector Gary A. Jones, CPA, CFE Audit Report of the Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission City of Weatherford - Project Number OJA-11-F Lengthening of Existing Runway

For the Period November 10, 2010 through December 2, 2013

This publication, issued by the Oklahoma State Auditor and Inspector's Office as authorized by 74 O.S. § 213.2.B, has not been printed, but is available on the agency's website (www.sai.ok.gov) and in the Oklahoma Department of Libraries Publications Clearinghouse Digital Collection, pursuant to 74 O.S. § 3105.B.



2300 N. Lincoln Blvd. • State Capitol, Room 100 • Oklahoma City, OK 73105 • Phone: 405.521.3495 • Fax: 405.521.3426

December 23, 2013

TO THE OKLAHOMA AERONAUTICS COMMISSION

At management's request, we have conducted an audit of the Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission (Commission) – City of Weatherford (state project number OJA-11-F) for the period November 10, 2010 through December 2, 2013. The objective of the audit was to determine whether expenditures paid to the City of Weatherford were in accordance with *Exhibit B-1 – Program Narrative* and *Exhibit B-2 – Project Costs* of the airport construction agreement.

According to Exhibit B-1 and Exhibit B-2, the project consisted of extending the existing runway and associated taxiways, installing corresponding lighting, and installing precision approach path indicator (PAPI) in order to increase the airports suitability for higher performance corporate aircraft. The project was budgeted at \$2,859,858. The Commission's share of the budget was \$790,291, the FAA's share of the budget was \$1,935,531 and the City of Weatherford's share was \$134,036.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objective.

Our audit procedures included inquiries of appropriate Commission personnel, the project engineer, the airport manager, and the Weatherford treasurer; inspection of all invoices and supporting documentation related to project reimbursements; and a physical inspection of the completed project conducted on December 12, 2013. These procedures indicated that costs paid to the City of Weatherford by the Commission appeared to be in accordance with the *Program Narrative* and the *Project Costs*.

This report is a public document pursuant to the Oklahoma Open Records Act (51 O.S. § 24A.1 et seq.), and shall be open to any person for inspection and copying.

Sincerely,

Sary aft

GARY A. JONES, CPA, CFE OKLAHOMA STATE AUDITOR & INSPECTOR

APPENDIX

The following information has been presented at the request of management. Therefore, we did not verify the data presented in the following schedules.

Category	Budget	Cha	ange Order	A	djusted Budget	Actual	Variance
Construction	\$ 2,449,722.65	\$	1,157.15	\$	2,450,879.80	\$ 2,391,283.73	\$ 59,596.07
Engineering	161,650.00					161,650.00	-
Advertising	735.50					66.45	669.05
Inspection	96,500.00					59,785.00	36,715.00
Testing	97,050.00					53,177.00	43,873.00
Update DBE	5,200.00					5,200.00	
EDP Packet	11,000.00					11,000.00	-
Survey/Update Approach Survey Rwy17/35	 38,000.00					 37,200.00	 800.00
Total Project Cost	\$ 2,859,858.15			\$	2,861,015.30	\$ 2,719,362.18	\$ 141,653.12

	Bu	idget Amount	I	Budget Amount Including Inge Orders		Actual	Variance
City's Share (1.20%)	\$	134,036.00	\$	135,193.15	\$	32,770.25	102,422.90
OAC's Share (27.62%)		790,291.00		790,291.00		751,060.93	39,230.07
FAA's Share (71.18%)		1,935,531.00		1,935,531.00		1,935,531.00	 _
	\$	2,859,858.00	\$	2,861,015.15	9	2,719,362.18	\$ 141,652.97

1. The 15¢ Δ is due to the fact that the B-2 rounds to the nearest dollar when calculating Sponsor/OAC/FAA shares

Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission Operational Audit Appendix- Project Costs (unaudited) and **Close Out Documentation**

							Clobe O	ut Docui	nentuti	
Line	Description	Bid Unit	Bid Quantity	Unit Price Bid		Bid Amount	Actual Quantity	Actual Cost	Quantity	Cost Variance
NO.	-								Variance	cost variance
	Traffic Maintenance	LS	1.00			10,300.00		\$ 10,300.00	0.00	s -
	Mobilization, Bonds and Temporary Erosion Control Pavement Saw Cut, Full Depth., PCC	LS LF	1.00 185.00	41,300.00 4.50		41,300.00 832.50	1.00 75.00	41,300.00 337.50	0.00 110.00	495.00
	Break-Up, Removal & Disposal of Existing Pavement	SY	1,500.00	4.50		12,150.00	1,266.00	10,254.60	234.00	1,895.40
	Remove Tree	Ea	2.00	750.00		1,500.00	-		2.00	1,500.00
6	Remove Fence	LF	800.00	8.00		6,400.00	690.00	5,520.00	110.00	880.00
	Unclassified Excavation: Strip Topsoil 6"	CY	6,800.00	3.50		23,800.00	6,800.00	23,800.00	0.00	-
	Unclassified Excavation: Normal Excavation to Required Grades Embankment in Place: Normal Embankment to required Grades	CY CY	7,200.00 16,700.00	4.00 5.50		28,800.00 91,850.00	7,200.00 16,225.00	28,800.00 89,237.50	0.00 475.00	2,612.50
	Embankment in Place: Replace Topsoil 6" Thick	CY	5,475.00	3.50		19,162.50	5,475.00	19,162.50	0.00	2,012.30
		Hrs	60.00	60.00		3,600.00	37.00	2,220.00	23.00	1 290 00
	Surveying (Cross Sectioning for Engineering use only) Construct 7" Aggregate Base Course	HIS	10,100.00	14.50		146,450.00	10,100.00	146,450.00	0.00	1,380.00
	Portland Cement Delivered to the site	Tn	220.00	170.00		37,400.00	220.00	37,400.00	0.00	-
14	Soil Cement Base Course, 8" thick	SY	10,100.00	3.10		31,310.00	10,100.00	31,310.00	0.00	-
	Construct 7" PCC Surface Course with Joints	SY	9,800.00	42.50		416,500.00	9,800.00	416,500.00	0.00	-
	Runway and Taxiway Paint Removal	SF	14,000.00	1.50		21,000.00	13,959.00	20,938.50	41.00	61.50
	Permanent Taxiway and Apron Painting w/ Reflective Media Permanent Taxiway and Apron Painting w/out Reflective Media (black paint)	SF SF	29,600.00 8,290.00	0.87 1.50		25,752.00 12,435.00	21,606.00 8,290.00	18,797.22 12,435.00	7994.00 0.00	6,954.78
	Provide and Install 24" RCP, Storm Sewer Pipe, Class III	LF	165.00	68.00		11,220.00	165.00	11,220.00	0.00	-
	Provide and Install 24" x 60" RCP, Storm Sewer Pipe, Class III	LF	255.00	298.00		75,990.00	255.00	75,990.00	0.00	-
	Remove 36" x 22" Corrugated Metal Arch Pipe	LF	160.00	10.00		1,600.00	160.00	1,600.00	0.00	-
	Construct Precast Concrete End Section for 24" RCP	Ea	2.00	680.00		1,360.00	2.00	1,360.00	0.00	-
	Construct Precast Concrete End Section for 24" x 60" RCP Seeding (Including Fertilizer and Watering)	Ea Ac	4.00 8.00	1,800.00 950.00		7,200.00 7,600.00	4.00	7,200.00	0.00 8.00	- 7,600.00
	Solid Slab Bermuda Grass Sodding	SY	14,000.00	2.70		37,800.00	14,000.00	37,800.00	0.00	-
	Furnish & Install Lighting Cable - No 8 AWG, 5kv, 1/c Type C, Stranded	LF	1,840.00	2.00		3,680.00	2,186.00	4,372.00	-346.00	(692.00)
27	Construct 6"X8" Trench w/ Backfill for Counterpoise	LF	1,380.00	2.00		2,760.00	1,582.00	3,164.00	-202.00	(404.00)
	Furnish & Install Counterpoise, No 6 AWG, Bare Stranded Copper Wire w/ G	LF	1,380.00	2.00		2,760.00	1,582.00	3,164.00	-202.00	(404.00)
	Construct 6" X 24" trench w/ Backfill for DB Cable	LF	1,765.00	2.70		4,765.50	1,825.00	4,927.50	-60.00	(162.00)
	Furnish/Install New base-Mounted L-858 Guidance Signs w/ PCC (2-Module) Furnish/Install New base-Mounted L-858 Guidance Signs w/ PCC (2-Module)	Ea Ea	2.00 5.00	3,960.00 4,955.00		7,920.00 24,775.00	2.00 5.00	7,920.00 24,775.00	0.00	-
	Furnish/Install New Stake-Mounted L-858 Guidance Signs w/ FCC (2-Mounte) Furnish/Install New Stake-Mounted MIRL Light Fixtures w/ clear glassware	Ea	7.00	4,955.00		5,075.00	7.00	5,075.00	0.00	-
	Remove, Store, Re-install Exisiting Stake-Mounted MITHL at Rwy 17 Threshh	LS	1.00	3,450.00		3,450.00	1.00	3,450.00	0.00	-
34	Remove exisiting 2-Box PAPI on Rwy 17 and deliver parts to Airport Manager	LS	1.00	1,100.00		1,100.00	1.00	1,100.00	0.00	-
35	Furnish and Install All New L-881, Style A, Class I PAPI on Rwy 17	LS	1.00	19,800.00		19,800.00	1.00	19,800.00	0.00	-
	Furnish and Install Lighting Junction Boxes with PCC Pad	Ea	1.00	1,700.00		1,700.00	1.00	1,700.00	0.00	-
	Furnish & Install new L-828 7.5 KW Constant Current Regulator	Ea	1.00	1,100.00		1,100.00	1.00	1,100.00	0.00	-
.38	Insurance Premium (Third Party) Subtotal for Base Bid	LS	1.00	950.00	\$	950.00 1,153,147.50	1.00	950.00 \$ 1,131,430.32	0.00	\$ 21,717.18
	Suboa for base blu				φ	1,155,147.50	• •	\$ 1,151,450.52	-	\$ 21,717.16
	Alternate 1 - Taxiway Widening									
39	Traffic Maintenance	LS	1.00	\$ 22,100.00	\$	22,100.00	1.00	\$ 22,100.00	0.00	\$-
40	Mobilization, Bonds and Temporary Erosion Control	LS	1.00	\$ 24,100.00		24,100.00	1.00	24,100.00	0.00	-
	Pavement Saw Cut, Full Depth., PCC	LF	485.00			1,333.75	-	-	0.00	1,333.75
	Break-Up, Removal & Disposal of Existing Pavement	SY	225.00	8.50		1,912.50	208.00	1,768.00	0.00	144.50
	Remove Concrete Head Wall	Ea CY	4.00 5,250.00	380.00 3.50		1,520.00	4.00 5,250.00	1,520.00	0.00	-
	Unclassified Excavation: Strip Topsoil 6" Unclassified Excavation: Normal Excavation to Required Grades	CY	7,450.00	4.50		18,375.00 33,525.00	4,817.00	18,375.00 21,676.50	0.00 0.00	11,848.50
	Embankment in Place: Normal Embankment to required Grades	CY	1,350.00	4.50		6,075.00	-,017.00	-	0.00	6,075.00
	Embankment in Place:Replace Topsoil 6" Thick	CY	3,575.00	3.50		12,512.50	3,213.00	11,245.50	0.00	1,267.00
48	Surveying (Cross Sectioning for Engineering use only)	Hrs	40.00	60.00		2,400.00	-	-	0.00	2,400.00
	Construct 7" Aggregate Base Course	SY	9,100.00	14.50		131,950.00	9,025.80	130,874.10	0.00	1,075.90
	Portland Cement Delivered to the site	Tn	215.00	170.00		36,550.00	173.49	29,493.30	0.00	7,056.70
	Soil Cement Base Course, 8" thick Construct 7" PCC Surface Course with Joints	SY SY	9,100.00 8,845.00	3.10 42.50		28,210.00 375,912.50	8,511.80 8,628.50	26,386.58 366,711.25	485.00 17.00	1,823.42 9,201.25
	Runway and Taxiway Paint Removal	SF	9,035.00	1.80		16,263.00	4,520.00	8,136.00	0.00	8,127.00
	Permanent Taxiway and Apron Painting w/ Reflective Media	SF	13,550.00	1.33		18,021.50	13,550.00	18,021.50	0.00	-
55	Permanent Taxiway and Apron Painting w/out Reflective Media (black paint)	SF	16,240.00	1.21		19,650.40	13,183.00	15,951.43	2633.00	3,698.97
	Provide and Install 18" RCP, Storm Sewer Pipe, Class III	LF	155.00	60.00		9,300.00	155.00	9,300.00	1350.00	-
	Provide and Install 24" RCP, Storm Sewer Pipe, Class III	LF	165.00	68.00		11,220.00	165.00	11,220.00	362.00	-
	Provide and Install 23" x 14" RCP Elliptical Storm Sewer Pipe, Class III Provide and Install 29" x 18" RCAP, Class III	LF	30.00 10.00	80.00 98.00		2,400.00 980.00	10.00	800.00 980.00	40.00 74.20	1,600.00
	Construct Single Grated Inlet	Ea	3.00	3,700.00		11,100.00	3.00	11,100.00	41.51	-
	Modify Existing Inlet-Remove Grate, Adjust to Grade	Ea	1.00	650.00		650.00	1.00	650.00	588.20	-
62	Construct Precast Concrete Elliptical End Section 23" x 14")	Ea	2.00	750.00		1,500.00	2.00	1,500.00	216.50	-
	Remove Existing 18" CGMP Storm Sewer - Waste Off Airport Property	LF	30.00	8.00		240.00	30.00	240.00	4515.00	-
	Seeding (Including Fertilizer and Watering)	Ac	6.00	750.00		4,500.00	-	-	0.00	4,500.00
	Solid Slab Bermuda Grass Sodding Construct 6" x 24" Tranch w/ bookfill for 2" PVC	SY	11,875.00	2.70		32,062.50	11,875.00	32,062.50	3057.00	
	Construct 6" x 24" Trench w/ backfill for 2" PVC Furnish & Install Lighting Cable - No 8 AWG, 5kv, 1/c Type C, Stranded	LF LF	11,690.00 14,220.00	2.55 1.95		29,809.50 27,729.00	13,556.00 21,420.00	34,567.80 41,769.00	0.00	(4,758.30) (14,040.00)
	Construct 6"X8" Trench w/ Backfill for Counterpoise	LF	11,530.00	1.95		20,177.50	13,018.00	22,781.50	20.00	(2,604.00)
	Furnish & Install Counterpoise, No 6 AWG, Bare Stranded Copper Wire w/ G	LF	11,530.00	1.85		21,330.50	13,018.00	24,083.30	0.00	(2,752.80)
	Furnish and Install 2" Schedule 40 PVC Conduit by Bore	LF	2,280.00	25.00		57,000.00	2,365.00	59,125.00	0.00	(2,125.00)
	Furnish and Install 2" Schedule 40 PVC Conduit in Trench	LF	11,700.00	2.00		23,400.00	15,279.00	30,558.00	0.00	(7,158.00)
	Furnish/Install base-Mounted L-852T LED Semi-Flush Mounted Taxyway Lig	Ea	73.00	1,510.00		110,230.00	73.00	110,230.00	0.00	-
	Furnish/Install base-Mounted L-861T LED ETES Taxyway Lights	Ea	167.00	905.00		151,135.00	154.00	139,370.00	0.00	11,765.00
	Furnish/Install Pull Boxes w/ L-867 Light Base and PCC Pad Furnish/Install Lighting Junction Boxes w/ PCC Pad	Ea Ea	49.00 1.00	600.00 2,000.00		29,400.00 2,000.00	50.00 1.00	30,000.00 2,000.00	6.00 0.00	(600.00)
15	Subtotal for Alternate 1	гa	1.00	2,000.00	\$	1,296,575.15	-	\$ 1,258,696.26	-	\$ 37,878.89
					Ψ	1,220,212.12	• •	- 1,230,090.20	-	- 57,676.69
	Total for Base Bid and Alternate 1				\$	2,449,722.65		\$ 2,390,126.58	:	\$ 59,596.07
									=	
Line	Description	Bid Unit	Change Order		Ch	ange Order Bid	Actual Quantity	Actual Cost	Quantity	Cost Variance
NO.	-		Bid Quantity	Unit Price Bid		Amount			Variance	
76	Supplemental Agreement	Ea	1.00	\$ 1,157.15	\$	1,157.15	1.00	\$ 1,157.15	0.00	\$ -
	Totol				¢	2,450,879.80		\$ 2301 202 72		\$ 59,596.07
	Total				\$	2,400,879.80	-	\$ 2,391,283.73	<u> </u>	ø 39,390.0/

Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission Operational Audit Appendix- Project Costs (unaudited) and **Close Out Documentation**

	Date:	11-1-2011
	Project Number:	OJA-11-F
		Thomas P. Stafford
TO:	Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1244 W Oklahoma City OK 73102 (405) 604-6900 – phone	
FROM:	(405) 604-6919 – fax Mark Schoonmaker Airport Manager 522 W Rainey	
	Address Weatherford, 73096 City/Town and Zip Code	· · · ·
	580-774-1971 Area Code and Phone Number	
This is to a final	dvise you that the above referenced p	project is complete and ready for
inspection.	The final inspection is scheduled to	begin at <u>11 A.M.</u> .
on <u>Nov</u>	vember 4, 2011 at Thoma (Date)	IL Stafford Airport

her Signature of above named person

Airport Manager Title of above named person

1

- 4

	FINAL INSPEC	CTION REPORT
Date: <u>Nov</u>	4, 2011, Project No: OJA-11	-F_, Airport: Thomas P. Stafford.
ro:	Oklahoma Aeronautics Com 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1244 Oklahoma City OK 73102 (405) 604-6900 – phone (405) 604-6919 – fax	
FROM:	Mark Schoonmaker Aurport Manager 522 W Rainey Address Weatherford, 7::096 City/Town and Zip Code 580-774-1971 Area Code and Phone Number ction on the above project was	made by <u>Mark Schoonmaker</u>
on <u>Nover</u>	mber 4, 2011 at <u>Thomas P.</u> (Location)	· (Arport Manager)
	attending inspection: name-title-organization	name-title-organization
	Martinez- SAC Services Inc.	John Creswell-Airport Manager-City of Weatherford
Dale Will	iams- OAC	Vivek Khanna-OAC
		Kevin Reeder-LBR Inc
	Reeder-Inspector	Alan Wilson- Libra Electric
Jed Bank Clarence	s-LBR Inc	Kevin Reeder-LBR Inc Alan Wilson- Libra Electric

1. Please install the remaining Solid Slab Bermuda Sodding, as directed by the Airport Manager.

2

2. Remove any, and all, construction debris from the project site. More specifically, but not limited to, there remains a considerable amount of foreign objects and debris (FOD) on the pavement surfaces, and adjacent to the work areas.

١,

3. The City is to grade the Safety Area Length, Beyond the Runway 17 End, to the grades, depicted on the plans. This work was deleted from the Contractor's work, by the City of Weatherford. This was due to a portion, of the golf course, not being relocated before the Contractor de-mobilized the equipment required to complete this work.

Anticipated completion date for above exceptions: <u>November 30, 2011</u>

Signature of above

æ

Airport Manager Title of above named person

3

1.0

	FINAL ACCEPTANCE	IOTICE	
	Date:	November 30, 2011	
	Project Number:	OJA-11-F	
	-	Thomas P. Stafford	
	7 aport		
0:	Oklahoma Aeronautics Commission 120 N. Robinson, Suite 1244 W	1	
	Oklahoma City OK 73102		
	(405) 604-6900 - phone (405) 604-6919 - fax		
2			
ROM:	Mark Schoonmaker		
	Airport Manager		
	522 W Rainey		
	Weatherford, 70096		
	City/Town and Zip Code		
	580-774-1971		
	Area Code and Phone Number		
	advise you that the exceptions found a	the final inspection ha	ve been
completed	l or corrected. The project is accepted	(Airport Manager)	
44.00	and at Thomas P	Stafford Airport	
on <u>11-30</u> (Date)		(Location)	
	1122		
M	Maharl	Airport Manager	
Signature of ab	ave named person	Title of above named person	
NOTE:	If no exceptions are found at the Fi	nal Inspection, submit t	his form at
NUTE:	the same time the Final Inspection	is completed, showing	acceptance
	of the Project.	9	
	4		

×



OFFICE OF THE STATE AUDITOR & INSPECTOR 2300 N. LINCOLN BOULEVARD, ROOM 100 OKLAHOMA CITY, OK 73105-4896

WWW.SAI.OK.GOV